



Bronfman at 36

AhYeKaH or AYKhaH?

Rabbi Avi Weinstein

Executive Director Emeritus of the Bronfman Fellowship

Hosea 6:7

וְהִמָּה כְּאָדָם עֲבָרוּ בְרִית שָׁם בְּגָדוּ בִי:

But they, to a man, have transgressed the Covenant. This is where they have been false to Me:

The plain meaning of the text is referring to "to a man," but the most literal meaning would refer to a particular man i.e. Adam and how he foreshadows the tragedies of the Jewish people.

The Petichta (Introduction) to the Midrash on Lamentations uses verses throughout the Tanakh that are concerned with the catastrophe of destruction and exile. Not surprising, there are lots of places.

Introduction to Eicha Rabba 4

Rabbi Abbahu began: "But they, like men [ke'adam], have violated the covenant" (Hosea 6:7) – this is Adam the first man. The Holy One blessed be He said: I brought Adam the first man into the Garden of Eden, I commanded him, and he violated My command. I sentenced him to banishment and expulsion, and I lamented him with eikha.

I brought him into the Garden of Eden, as it is stated: "He placed him in the Garden of Eden" (Genesis 2:15). I commanded him, as it is stated: "The Lord God commanded the man saying.... [but from the tree of knowledge of good and evil you shall not eat]" (Genesis 2:16–17).

He violated My command, as it is stated: "Have [you eaten] from the tree from which I commanded you [not to eat?]" (Genesis 3:11). I sentenced him to banishment, as it is stated: "He banished the man" (Genesis 3:24). I sentenced him to expulsion, as it is stated: "The Lord [God] sent him from the Garden of Eden" (Genesis 3:23). I lamented him with eikha, as it is stated: "He said to him: Where are you [ayekal]" (Genesis 3:9); it is written eikha.

His descendants, too, I brought into the Land of Israel, as it is stated: "I brought you into a



Bronfman at 36

fruitful land" (Jeremiah 2:7). I commanded them, as it is stated: "Command the children of Israel" (Leviticus 24:2). They violated My command, as it is stated: "All Israel has violated your Torah" (Daniel 9:11). I sentenced them to banishment, as it is stated: "From My house I will banish them" (Hosea 9:15). I sentenced them to expulsion, as it is stated: "Send them from My presence and let them go" (Jeremiah 15:1). I lamented them with: "How does... she sit solitary?" (Lamentations 1:1).



Talmud Sanhedrin 38b

And Rav Yehuda says that Rav says: Adam the first man was a heretic, as it is stated: "And the Lord called to the man and said to him: Where are you?" (Genesis 3:9), meaning, to where has your heart turned, indicating that Adam turned from the path of truth. Rabbi Yitzhak says: He was one who drew his foreskin forward, so as to remove any indication that he was circumcised. It is written here: "And they like men [adam] have transgressed the covenant" (Hosea 6:7), and it is written there: "And the uncircumcised male who is not circumcised in the flesh of his foreskin, that soul shall be cut off from his people; he has broken My covenant" (Genesis 17:14).

Questions for discussion:

The Midrash changes the way the Torah vocalizes AhYeKaH (Where are you) into AYKhaH (How???). How does this change the original narrative when God questions Adam about eating from the forbidden fruit?

What is the point of comparing Adam to B'nei Yisrael? What is the Midrash trying to say?

AyKHaH is concerned with "how," AhYeKaH focuses on the "who." In your life, reflect on the place of AYKhaH in your AhYeKah and how that informs where and indeed who you are.

Questions for discussion:

How does R. Yehuda understand the verse in Hosea, and how that informs "Where are you?"

Who is Rav Yehuda addressing with this extreme statement?